

Minutes, 29 December 1957.

The session on Mycenaean Studies held in the 89th Annual Meeting of the American Philological Association, 29 December 1957, was generally deemed an auspicious occasion. The attendance for the first several papers would have been larger had the room also been larger. Despite the natural tendency of papers and sessions to prolong themselves (introductions, eight papers, and a few questions together occupied not all of three hours), the continued attention of a considerable and loyal group was maintained to the end. Some notice of the session has appeared in the newspapers (N.Y. Times, Dec. 31). Summaries of the papers follow.

1. G. P. Goold (Univ. of Manitoba), "The problem of the Linear A tablets" -- A summary and criticism of much of the recent study of these texts. The foundation for any study is Pugliese Carratelli's publication of the Haghia Triadha texts. Among subsequent studies is Goold and Pope's The Cretan Linear A Script, in which are established three groups of signs, numerals, ideograms including ligatures, and about 60 phonetic signs. Of these most can be equated with Linear B forms, and will have similar values. The conclusions were that Linear A is not Greek in inflection, that it possessed a common prefix a-, may have lacked a distinction of l and r, and the vowel o, and that no connection with -nthos and -ssos names is apparent. Furumark's Linear A und die altkretische Sprache is a more systematic attempt at a rigidly internal analysis, on the model of Ventris' work. Words were divided into groups, place-names, personal-names, occupations, products, and general vocabulary. A grid of the signs in phonetic relationship was constructed, by which agreement of forms and values with Linear B signs seemed confirmed. The Mycenaean thus took over the whole system of writing intact. About 16 products (e.g. coriander, sesame), 10 vocabulary words, some place- and personal-names are recognized. Affinities of the language seem to lie with Asianic languages. Among other treatments, Georgiev, working from equation of values in Linear A and B recognizes a language of IE connections, but pre-Hellenic. Gordon reads at least 20 words as Semitic and Akkadian, of which 4 (ku-ro, su-pu, ka-ro-pa<sub>3</sub>, su-pa<sub>3</sub>-ra) are attractive. Davis (Univ. of Natal) reads as Semitic among other words ki-ro 'deficit' and points to Semitic borrowings in Linear B. Further he suggests that the values of Linear A signs may be acrophonically connected with their representations. Pope (Univ. of Cape Town) thinks the language Akkadian (ku-na-su 'species of wheat', ka-ro-pa<sub>3</sub>) and adds that the length of words accords with Semitic languages. G.'s conclusions are that despite substantial progress, no solution yet proposed can stand on its own. Against the Semitic hypotheses, the Semitic languages (like Greek) make rigorous distinction of r and l, Linear A and B do not. The language may be unrelated to known languages; if so, the paucity of texts and of comparable materials will make difficult and remote a definitive solution. -- Comment by Caldwell that Semitic words, even correctly read, may be loan-words, and need not identify the language of Linear A. Comment by Whatmough on the paucity of material. -- (G. writes that "Gordon's latest proposals weaken rather than strengthen the plausibility of his earlier equations: in particular, the two-sign group ku-ro (= Semitic kull- 'all'), which was and still is the most attractive identification, is now interpreted as mu-ru (= Akkadian mullu 'paid out'). Such fluidity of treatment clearly indicates the tentative nature of all the proposals so far made by advocates of the Semitic Hypothesis.")

2. M. Lang (Bryn Mawr Coll.), "A missing link" - which is the piece joining Ta709 and 712, found in this year's excavations. The set of Ta texts is thus completed by the resulting text of Ta709.

pi-je-ra<sub>3</sub> to-qi-de-ja \*200 3 pa-ko-to a-pe-te-me-ne \*214 2  
 po-ro-e-ke-te-ri-ja \*LADLE? 1 ko-te-ri-ja 6  
 \*85-te 1 pu-ra-u-to-ro 2 pa<sub>2</sub>-ra-to-ro 1  
 e-ka-ra a-pi-go-to pe-de-we-sa 1  
 e-ka-ra i-to-we-sa pe-de-we-sa so-we-ne-ja \*85-de-we-sa-qe 1  
 ti-ri-po ke-re-si-jo we-ke ai<sub>2</sub>?-ke-u \*201 1  
 ti-ri-po ke-re-si-jo we-ke o-pi-ke-wi-ri-je-u \*201 1

The proposed translation:

Three phialai with spiral designs; two unroped tubs; one turner's chisel;  
 six hammers; one brush; two fire-tongs; one fire-rake; one hearth with  
 edge running round and footed; one hearth equipped with vertical crane,  
 footed, decorated with ... and ..., one tripod of Cretan workmanship  
 with goat decoration; one tripod of Cretan workmanship ....

\*214 is a tub-shaped ideogram; pa-ko-to: phaktai; a-pe-te-me-ne: apenthsmene;  
 po-ro-e-ke-te-ri-ja: proekheteria (cp. Hsch. potek-) e-ka-ra: eskbara;  
 i-to-we-sa: istowessa. Although the new fragment provides striking confirmation  
 for fire-tools and a form possibly parallel to po-ro-e-ke in other Ta texts,  
 neither it nor the new term descriptive of tripods can decide the interpretation  
 of the phrase ke-re-si-jo we-ke ai<sub>2</sub>?-ke-u, nor determine whether the whole set  
 is a tomb inventory or the objects needed for the investiture of a high official.  
 -- Comment by Jameson on Homeric use of eskbara rather than hestia. -- The 1957  
 Pylos tablets will be published shortly in AJA.

3. J. Whatmough (Harvard Univ.), "Selected items of vocabulary in Mycenaean  
 Greek" - How far can Mycenaean Greek be called Homeric Greek? W. thinks one  
 should take a cautionary approach because the time gap is great and it involves  
 the question of how quickly a language changes. Nonetheless, with Maas, Chadwick,  
 and Webster, he believes that a dactylic rhythm is to be recognized in Linear B.  
 The relationship to Homeric meter is more problematic. Turner, while admitting  
 archaeological correlations of the Mycenaean and Homeric worlds, demurs at  
 linguistic (at least rhythmical) connexions. Chadwick also thinks this approach  
 dangerous; but here there is prejudice against believing that dactylic verse  
 could have been written as early as 1500 BC. W. discounts the opinion of some  
 that the readings in Docs. look un-Greek. "From the clues of V. and C. you get  
 something that looks only too much like the earliest Greek." Mycenaean Greek  
 already shows the germs of Homeric Greek, and Homeric verse could have been  
 written any time between 1500 and 800 BC. Arguments concerning the influence  
 of the laryngeal on Homeric metrics: Where a final vowel is short but must be  
 scanned long, or in hiatus, W. believes we have to do with an original laryngeal,  
 movable nu, or inserted de or other rational explanations, but not "metrical  
 license." W. illustrates with "to be": Lin. B, e-e-si 3 pl. occurs in com-  
 pounds and alone, and matches Hitt. asantsi. Root not \*es- but \*Hes-. There-  
 fore Att. eisi is regular, and Hom. eāsi an artificial metrical substitute.  
 Most postulate an intermediate stage, \*Hensi (older \*Heenti, \*Hesenti), with  
 a glottal stop corresponding to Gk smooth breathing. Mycenaean Gk does not  
 write h; but not necessarily psilosis. Sturtevant showed that Gk alphabet  
 took over the spirant [X]. Greeks did not have at that date aspiration but  
 a glottal consonant. Also in Lin. B a<sub>2</sub>te-ro (heteros) we must postulate  
 initially either a glottal catch or laryngeal. This may explain the second  
 sign for a, a<sub>2</sub>; the possibility should be explored. Andrews thought a<sub>2</sub> the  
 IE schwa; W. thinks it may be from H<sub>2</sub>e. Neuter pls. of thematic stems (-os)  
 as Gk -a, for eH<sub>2</sub>, cf. ra<sub>2</sub> in nom. sg. agent nouns for ria; pi-a<sub>2</sub>-ra, pi-je-ra  
 for phiale, phiele. In practically all cases where a metrical difficulty is  
 involved in Homer, W. thinks the solution to the metrical problem will come  
 through further study of the oldest history of Greek, with the help of Mycenaean  
 evidence. -- The material of this paper will be incorporated in forthcoming  
Lowell lectures.

4. F. Householder (Indiana Univ.), "Palatalized consonants in Early Greek"-- The variety of outcomes of IE sequences of short vowel + consonant + non-syllabic i, as seen in the following table, together with the testimony of Mycenaean spellings of the same, suggest that the Mycenaeans had reached the stage of palatalized consonants, though we cannot be sure exactly how they were written, and that the differentiation seen in the dialects had just begun.

| IE            | Proto-Greek? | Transliterated Spellings |         |          |          |          |
|---------------|--------------|--------------------------|---------|----------|----------|----------|
|               |              | Dor. &c                  | Lesb.&c | Att(Arc) | BoeoCret | Cypr     |
| 1. -t/dh/ j-  | -s:-         | -ss-                     | -ss-    | -s-      | -tt(z)-  | -ss-?    |
| 2. -nt/ndh j- | -ns-         | -:s-                     | -:s     | -:s(ns)- | -ns-     | -ns-?    |
| 3. -k/gh j-   | -ts-         | -ss-                     | -ss-    | -tt-     | -tt-     | -ss-     |
| 4. -d/g/- j-  | -dz-         | -z-                      | -z(sd)- | -z-      | -dd(z)-  | -z-      |
| 5. *-n/r j-   | -n:/r:-      | -in/ir-                  | -in/ir- | -in/ir-  | -in/ir-  | -in/ir-  |
| 6. **-n/r j-  | -n:/r:-      | -:n/:r-                  | -nn/rr- | -:n/:r-  | -:n/:r-  | -:n/:r-? |
| 7. -l j-      | -l:-         | -ll-                     | -ll-    | -ll-     | -ll-     | -il-     |

\* after a/o. - means word-initial. -t/d/dh/s - s- similar to 1.

\*\* after e/i/u. -t - w- similar to 2. -n/r - s- similar to 5 and 6.

The possible Mycenaean testimony includes: for -wj- (not orig. IE) di-u-ja, me-u-jo, (pa2)-si-re-wi-jo-te, pa-ra-wa-jo-di-wja, mewjo, basile:wjontes, para:wjo:, for -kj- po-ni-ki-ja - phoinikja, for -dj- pe-ki-je-we - pedjewes, for -rj- ku-pa-ro2, a-ro2-a, o-ro-jo, a-ra-(ka-)te-ja - kuparjos, arjoha, orjo:n (Hsch.) arakterjai (Hsch.), for -nj- mu-jo-me-no - \*munjomenos (amunomenos), for -lj- pa2-ra2-te, o-mi-ri-jo-i, o-pi-ke-ri-jo-de, e-ke-jo-to - paljantei (?Balj-), homiljoihi, opikeljoi de (epikelomai), enkeljonto: (enkello:), for -sj- to-so-pe-ma = tošjon spërma. The Mycenaean spellings may then be for 1, 2 -s-, for 3 -š-, -kij-, for 4 -z-, -dij-, for 5, 6 (r)-r2-, -r<sup>v</sup>j-, -j-, for 7 -r2-, -rij-, -j-, for -sj- -s-, -svj-, for wj s, svj, for wj -uj-, -wvj-.

5. M. H. Jameson (Univ. of Pennsylvania) "The Mycenaean and Homeric Political systems." Major differences between the political systems of Mycenaean, Homeric, and classical times, corresponding to varying economic and historical conditions, are revealed in the political terms of the tablets and their subsequent history. The Mycenaean system seen in the texts is far more complex than the Homeric. Three levels need to be distinguished for a valid comparison: (1) the local--the pa2-si-re-we (basilewes) and possibly ko-re-te-re, and the Pylian towns in the tablets, corresponding to the basileis of Odysseus's Ithacan kingdom and the nine towns and nine hedrai of Pylos. (2) the regional--the single wa-na-ka of Pylos or of Knossos, with his subordinate, probably military, ra-wa-ke-ta- (lawagetas), corresponding to the major heroes of the Iliad, and Odysseus, Nestor in the Odyssey. (3) the "Pan Achaean" level of the Iliad with Agamemnon, unknown from the tablets and perhaps entirely fictitious. In Homer the complex superstructure of Mycenaean times is lost and the local basileus rises in social status and preempts the foreground, and in the simpler post-Mycenaean conditions each king must be his own warleader. Only in the basic themes of the old stories may there be a reflection of Mycenaean conditions (probably on a regional level) the conflict of Achilles and Agamemnon may reflect tensions between war leader and wanax. But the stories are told in terms of Iron Age society.

6. A. Samuel (Yale Univ.), "The sizes of places mentioned in the Pylos tablets"--The compilation of tables to establish with increased precision the relative importance of Pylian places. The type of tabulation is seen in the following extract the commodities appear in the columns the rank of their assessment is indicated by: I, top 20%, II, mid 30%, III, low 50%. For Produce the number of occurrences is shown. The frequency of occurrence, the kind of assessment and its size appear as criteria of the importance of the place

| Name        | No. of Classes | Group Assignment |         |        |      |        |         |         |
|-------------|----------------|------------------|---------|--------|------|--------|---------|---------|
|             |                | Human            | Mineral | Animal | Gold | Bronze | Textile | Produce |
| A-ke-re-wa  | 7              | I                | -       | II     | II   | I      | II      | 2       |
| A-Pu2       | 5              | III              | -       | III    | II   | II     | II      | 1       |
| Pa-ki-ja-na | 12             | I                | II      | III    | II   | III    | II      | 5       |
| Pu-ro       | 5              | I                | -       | I      | -    | -      | -       | 3       |
| I-wa-so     | 2              | I                | -       | II     | -    | -      | -       | -       |

The most important towns are found in Jn829 plus A-si-ja-ti-ja, E-ri-no-wo-te, E-as-re-wi-ja, Puro. Of ca. 200 place-names there are ca. 100 smaller towns which appear in only one occurrence. Here the assessment is almost always something that could be produced at home, and the allotment appropriate for a farming community.

7. W. McDonald (Univ. of Minnesota), "Early Greek attitudes toward environment as indicated by their place-names" - which show lively appreciation and interest in the physical environment and a striking absence of the later habit of naming places for people, real or mythical. M. analyzes 189 place-names with plausible Gk etymologies: Flora, e.g. Pteleon, 30 (16%), Fauna, e.g. Rheneia, 17 (9%), Physical description, e.g. Aipeia, 96 (50%), Euphemistic, e.g. Gonoessa, 18 (10%), Historical, e.g. Stratie, 13 (7%), Personal names, e.g. Athenai, 12 (6%). These 189 come from 330 of presumed Gk. origin, within 405 "Archaic" names (in literature before 600 BC) (230 cities, 60 bodies of water, 47 islands, 34 mountains, 22 districts) and 205 "Mycenaean" names, of which 72 are equated with names known from other sources, 36 of these being duplications with the "Archaic" place-names.

8. J. Puhvel (Univ. of Texas) "Mycenaean royal names in the light of Helladic religion" - An attempt to assay important features of the interplay of Indo-European and Minoan elements, out of the fusion of which developed Mycenaean and later Classical Greek culture. The twofold sacral aspects of Helladic and Homeric kingship were studied, on the one hand the 'sanctioning by Zeus' involving social obligation, and on the other the Minoan 'protection by the palace goddess', reflecting more Oriental matrilinear concepts. It was then shown that the chief Mycenaean royal title, wanax, for which P. has previously claimed Indo-European origin, is a divine epithet transferred to royalty by the placing of kingship under the aegis of the palace goddess, on the analogy of the development of several Indo-European gods into paredroi within the predominantly female Minoan pantheon. As a divine title wanax is still particularly characteristic of the specific gods who have undergone this development. The argument receives strong support from the Pylos tablets of 1955.--The material will be presented in fuller form in an article 'Helladic kingship and the gods', to appear in the forthcoming Sundwall Festschrift.

#### Continuation No. 7, Mycenaean Bibliography

Baffioni, G., Testi minoici e micenei negli scavi archeologici del secolo XX, Giornale Italiano di Filologia 10 (1957) 230-235.

Bàytot, J., Minoenne (Dechiffrement de l'écriture), Supplement au Dictionnaire de la Bible 5 (1957) 1294-1299.

Cassola, F., La Ionia nel mondo miceneo, Ediz. Scient. Ital., Napoli 1957.

Fischer, Il, Cronica Indo-Europeana, Studi si cercatari Linguistce 8 (1957) 89-100.

Gallavotti, C., Ares e Areios prima di Omere, Rivista di Filologia 1957:3 225-233.

Hood, S., Rev. Schachermeyr, Die älteste K., Gnomon 29 (1957) 511-515.